

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK
COUNTY OF NEW YORK

-----X

Rafaela Espinal f/k/a Rafaela Espinal-Pacheo,

Plaintiffs,

- against -

New York City Department of Education, Richard Carranza, Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education Individually, Cheryl Watson-Harris, Former First Deputy Chancellor of the New York City Department of Education Individually, David Hay, Ursulina Ramirez, New York City Department of Education Chief Operating Officer Individually and “John Does” and “Jane Does” 1-25 whose names are currently unknown,

Defendants.

-----X

**AFFIRMATION OF
NICHOLAS L. COLLINS IN
SUPPORT OF
DEFENDANTS’ MOTION
TO DISMISS THE
COMPLAINT**

Index No.: 151246/2021

NICHOLAS L. COLLINS, an attorney duly admitted to practice law before the courts of the State of New York, affirms pursuant to CPLR 2106 under penalty of perjury that the following is true and correct:

1. I am an Assistant Corporation Counsel in the Office of James E. Johnson, Corporation Counsel of the City of New York, attorney for defendants the New York City Department of Education (“Department of Education” or “DOE”), Richard Carranza, Cheryl Watson-Harris, David Hay, and Ursulina Ramirez (collectively “Defendants”) in the above-captioned action. As such, I am familiar with the facts stated below. I submit this Affirmation in Support of Defendants’ Motion to Dismiss the Complaint.

2. Annexed hereto as “**Exhibit A**” is a true and correct copy of plaintiff’s Complaint, filed on February 3, 2021.

3. Annexed hereto as “**Exhibit B**” is the notarized affidavit of non-party Samantha Williamson, signed and dated on April 30, 2011. Samantha Williamson is an employee of the New York City Law Department and conducted a Notice of Claim search on the “OASIS” system.

Dated: New York, New York
April 30, 2021

JAMES E. JOHNSON
Corporation Counsel of the City of New York
Attorney for Defendants
100 Church Street
New York, New York 10007
(646) 939-7622
nicollin@law.nyc.gov

By: *Nicholas L. Collins*
Nicholas L. Collins
Assistant Corporation Counsel

VIA NYSCEF
TO: Helen J. Setton
Israel Goldberg
Attorneys for Plaintiffs
Goldberg & Markus PLLC
14 Wall Street, Suite 2064
New York, NY 10005